

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 047 232

AC 010 023

AUTHOR Ohliger, John  
TITLE Seminar on Adult Education: ED925.33, Winter Quarter 1971. Bibliography.  
INSTITUTION Ohio State Univ., Columbus. Center for Adult Education.  
PUB DATE 71  
NOTE 39p.  
EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF-\$0.65 HC-\$3.29  
DESCRIPTORS \*Adult Education, \*Adult Educators, \*Annotated Bibliographies, Continuous Learning, Cultural Factors, \*Educational Change, \*Educational Philosophy, Independent Study, Seminars, Social Change, Social Factors  
IDENTIFIERS Freire (Paulo), Illich (Ivan)

ABSTRACT

Beginning with the seminar textbook itself ("Pedagogy of the Oppressed," by Paulo Freire), this annotated bibliography goes on to list and describe (usually through excerpted passages) 45 articles and other works by or about Ivan Illich, his colleagues, and the Center for Intercultural Documentation at Cuernavaca, Mexico. Fifty other items deal with such concerns as self-directed adult learning, social and cultural trends, continuing education, and the need for renewal in the overall provision of education. (LY)

# THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY

COLLEGE OF EDUCATION  
1945 NORTH HIGH STREET  
COLUMBUS, OHIO 43210

CENTER FOR ADULT EDUCATION

422-1585

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

SEMINAR ON ADULT EDUCATION: ED925.33, WINTER QUARTER 1971

"I want to live in mutual education up to  
the moment, and in the moment, of my  
death." Ivan Illich

SEMINAR TOPIC: The Learning Society or the Person Learning: The  
Ideas of Ivan Illich and Others as They Apply to  
Issues of Adult Education.

PREPARED BY: John Ohliger, Associate Professor of Adult Education  
Office: 363 Arps Hall, Phone: 422-1585  
Home phone: 888-1480  
Secretary's Office: 353 Arps Hall

TEXTBOOK: The textbook for purchase for this seminar is:

Freire, Paulo. Pedagogy of the Oppressed. 186 pages.  
Published at \$5.95 by Herder and Herder, 232 Madison  
Avenue, New York, New York 10016

From the jacket: "In the course of Freire's work and travels  
in the Third World and as a result of his studies in the philosophy  
of education, he evolved a theory for the education of illiterates,  
especially adults, based on the conviction that every human being,  
no matter how 'ignorant' or submerged in the 'culture of silence,' is  
capable of looking critically at his world in a dialogical encounter  
with others, and that provided with the proper tools for such an  
encounter he can gradually perceive his personal and social reality and  
deal critically with it. When an illiterate peasant participates  
in this sort of educational experience he comes to a new awareness  
of self, a new sense of dignity; he is stirred by a new hope. As  
the illiterate learns, his world becomes radically transformed and  
he is no longer willing to be a mere object responding to changes  
occurring around him. He is more likely to decide to take upon  
himself, with his fellow men, the struggle to change the structures  
of society that until now have served to repress him."

INTRODUCTORY STATEMENT: The quotations presented with the bibliographic items below are samples, but not necessarily representative samples. They are mainly statements that I find provocative.

ITEMS, BY OR ABOUT, IVAN ILLICH, HIS COLLEAGUES, AND THE CENTER FOR INTERCULTURAL DOCUMENTATION (CIDOC)

1. "Foot Camp for Urbanities," Time, (Oct. 27, 1961), p. 65. A brief description of the Center soon after it was opened. "Illich and his staff deliberately make the students angry, start arguments, challenge cherished beliefs."
2. "Camara and Illich," Commonweal, Vol. 89, (Feb. 7, 1969), pp. 575-6. Editorial: "Msgr. Illich is apparently paying the price for being one of the Church's most original and outspoken innovators...Illich is one of Church's most valuable figures, not only for his commitment to radical change for Latin America but also for his desire to avoid the 'clericalism of the left' which sometimes infects progressive Catholic movements."
3. Center for Intercultural Documentation. Catalogo de Publicaciones 1970 Available from the Center, APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico. Lists the many publications of the Center in English and Spanish. Among the many publications of the Center is a special service called CIDOC DOCUMENTA/Alternatives in Education: "For the past two years, a group of people at CIDOC has been thinking about radical alternatives to the school system. Some of you have been with us in

Cuernavaca and have shown that you share our concern, if not all our ideas. Others of you have written to us out of shared interest. We now ask you to actively collaborate with us by sharing information, ideas and critical judgments. Our medium for continued collaboration is CIDOC DOCUMENTA. The idea is simple. All documents which originate in our seminar, as well as any material considered especially significant by its members, will be reproduced at CIDOC and distributed to subscribers, who will be invited to send us critical comment or further documentation which they feel should be circulated among their colleagues. Each subscribing member will pay a \$25.00 introductory fee. Administrative expenses and printing costs will be defrayed out of this deposit by charging 10 cents per page if there are 15 to 50 subscribers, 5 cents per page if there are between 50 and 120 subscribers, and 3 cents per page if there are more than 120 subscribers. Airmail postage will also be deducted from the \$25.00 deposit. Most documents will be in English. Those in other languages will not be translated. All members are encouraged to submit work-in-progress to the criticism of this circle of collaborators, before giving it wide circulation through means of communication which are less defined by common interest. The editor of this service, Dennis Sullivan, is a permanent member of the

seminar on Alternatives in Education. He will have final responsibility for the selection of documents, as well as for introducing, annotating or condensing them when necessary. Preference in selection will be given to documents written by seminar participants. Among those who have already joined our discussions are Paul Goodman, John Holt, Jonathan Kozol, Carl Bereiter, Theodore Newcomb, Paulo Freire, Layman Allen, Fred Goodman and Luis Ratinoff. We hope that you will join us, not only by receiving the documents which originate in Cuernavaca, but also by critically responding with your own contributions to our common inquiry. Mail your introductory fee (\$25.00) to: Dennis Sullivan, CIDOC, APDO, 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico."

4. Center for Intercultural Documentation. Study in Cuernavaca: Course Catalogue. Available free from CIDOC, APDO. 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico. Provides a complete description of the Center plus course descriptions including those on Alternatives in Education.

5. "Controversial Priest: Ivan Illich: Man in the News," The New York Times, (Jan. 23, 1969), p.2. "(Illich) is not a man who comes out for things," a friend said. "He asks -- that is his style. He is a man who has dug into the matter very deeply and who gets people to think about it. That's a much more effective threat for change than coming out for things."

5. Cowan, Wayne H. "An Interview with Ivan Illich." Christianity and Crisis, Vol. 29, No. 14, (Aug. 4, 1969), pp 213-219. Illich: "I want to do away with a possible misleading conception. CIDOC was founded only in 1964, while I came to Mexico with two friends -- Jerry Morris and Theodoro Stancioff -- in 1961. . . .In addition to the language school we started a program for intercultural sensitivity development, mostly for missionaries on their way to Latin America. This organization was not CIDOC; it was the Center for Intercultural Formation (CIF)...Within CIF, right from the beginning, my room and two or three others remained reserved as a kind of a club, a kind of independent thinkery where people could get together on any subject, related always to the reaction of the human personality to social change...By 1963-64 Valentine Borremans, then our librarian (now CIDOC's Director), developed the library into a unique research tool on this kind of subject...(Those who came) also wanted to take part in little seminars in the library. So we set up a new organization called CIDOC, Center for Intercultural Documentation. Furthermore, we had come to the conviction by that time that most of the message

we had wanted to get across to the religious orders had succeeded...(CIDOC is a) free club for the search of surprise (where we try) to keep open the platform between the Americas where people go who want to be surprised rather than to give or find an answer, a place where people go who want help in refining their questioning, rather than completing the answers they have gotten...At this moment, it is hardly possible to encourage independent thinking and rethinking...to encourage learning rather than to perfect teaching, to invite adults to explore where to go from a point they have barely reached and are not yet quite capable of formulating without asking them to come to clearer and more deadly correct formulations of what they thought yesterday. You can't engage in such types of educational proceedings without

necessarily being accused of correcting these adults, of making them less loyal to the institutions with which they were associated, less true believers in the ideology of the institution...The main theme of CIDOC is the study of the relationship between what I call religious or para-religious structures of thought and social change...I am not a contesting priest or a revolutionary priest or a clergyman organizing factions within the church or an apostolically interested ex-priest or a lay theologian...(I am) a clergyman who has worked as such and in order to do an academic job has entirely and totally renounced all privileges, titles, advantages of the clerical state, but who, at the same time, remains a very faithful, entirely orthodox believer in the church and lover of the church...The search for alternatives to the school system and their public discussion has a much more liberalizing effect and ultimately is much more revolutionary than the suggestion that one government now in power should be replaced by another as long as that government, too, supports the same value-oriented school system. The same thing could be repeated about the military as another value-oriented institution or, as we have said, though by now it is quite tertiary in importance, the church...I am not a prophet, and I do not want to become a futurologist. I think that what we should be concerned with here at CIDOC is to be humorists. That is, people who are constantly aware of the constraints and limitations of the categories with which we think, people who are continuously aware that through the development of imagination and by looking at flowers you can kind of imagine an analog to every social system that is justly slightly off-key and, therefore, makes you smile. At CIDOC, in the seminar Everett Reimer directs and in which I have taken part for the last three years (it meets twice a year for a month), we have no intention of proposing concrete and specific applicable alternatives in front of a futuristic scenario for the present school system. But in this we attempt to develop a language in which one can speak about schools without ever making reference to education, and in which one can speak about education without continuously making reference to years of attendance, to school age, to promotion, to grades, to curriculum and similar ritual elements. What I personally hope can be achieved by this is freer thinking. Here I refer to Ernst Bloch and his distinction between the distant future, the abstract future -- that about which I can only think conceptually by extrapolating presently existing trends, about which I can speak with expectation but not with hope -- and that other future which is the generalization of the now-existing experiences, long-haired in the Thomas More sense, the utopic projection of what now exists and can be thought an extension into an expanded presence or, if you want, an imminent future about which I can speak with hope. CIDOC is primarily an educational institution; I want to emphasize this."

6. Dolan, Dan. "The Life of Ivan Illich," New Republic, Vol. 160, (March 1, 1969), pp. 18-19. Dolan, a teaching fellow at the University of Pennsylvania, visited CIDOC and reports here on the Center and on Illich: "Tragedy is implicit in the situation, and many will not dare as he does."
7. Fiske, Edward B. "Vatican Curb Aimed at Cultural Center of Reform Advocate," The New York Times, (Jan. 23, 1969), pp. 14. "Operating expenses (for CIDOC), which come to approximately \$240,000 a year, come from tuition, fees and from sale of publications." Illich: "I deeply regret the possibility that -- entirely against our will and because of this Roman decree -- my name and the name of this

center should become the focal point for still another tragic round of disruptive and uncreative uproar within the church. Certainly none of us will join it."

8. Fiske, Edward B. "Head of Cultural Center Tells of Secret Hearing in Vatican," The New York Times, (Feb. 4, 1969), p. 2. "Msgr. Ivan Illich, leader of a controversial cultural center here (Cuernavaca), has made public highly classified documents describing a secret appearance before the Vatican Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, the former Holy Office...In Rome, Msgr. Luigi De Magistris, an official of the Congregation, refused to confirm or deny that Msgr. Illich had made such an appearance. 'For the press, we simply do not exist,' he said."
9. Fitzpatrick, Joseph P. "What Is He Getting At?" America, Vol. 116, No. 12, (March 25, 1967), pp. 444-449. "Part of the controversy is Msgr. Illich himself: his personality, his style, his methods. He is an amazingly brilliant man, who likes to have bright people around him and finds it difficult to conceal his disdain for what he considers stupidity. He is a polyglot genius who speaks nine languages almost without a trace of accent, a cosmopolite at home in any nation of Western Europe or the Western Hemisphere....He can turn on irresistible charm, or show brutal ridicule and disdain. And he has a trace of Jewish ancestry that he exploits to the utmost...He has a vision of the radical changes the Church must undergo if it is to be Christ present to the men of the 21st century. And he is convinced that these changes cannot be achieved without violence to self -- and sometimes to others. 'I have come to bring not peace but a sword,' says the Lord. He punishes himself by work to such a degree that amateur psychiatrists have called him a masochist. In like manner, he punishes anyone who works with him....He is, therefore, and always will be a sign of contradiction and a focus of controversy."
10. Freire, Paulo. "The Adult Literacy Process as Cultural Action for Freedom," Harvard Educational Review, Vol. 40, No. 2, (May 1970), pp. 205-225. First and second parts of an essay written while the author was a Fellow at the Center for the Study of Development and Social Change, Cambridge, Mass. 02138. Translated by Loretta Stover.
11. Freire, Paulo. "Cultural Action and Conscientization," Harvard Educational Review, Vol. 40, No. 2, (August 1970), pp. 452-477. Third part of Freire's essay "Conscientization: Cultural Action for Freedom" translated by Loretta Stover. First two parts appeared in May 1970 issue of this journal. "Conscientization refers to the process in which men, not as recipients, but as knowing subjects, achieve a deepening awareness both of the socio-cultural reality which shapes their lives and of their capacity to transform that reality."
12. Freire, Paulo. "Cultural Freedom in Latin America" in Human Rights and the Liberation of Man in the Americas. Edited by Louis M. Colonnese. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1970. "The more the rise of the masses is emphasized in Latin America, the more the elite holding power, committed to foreign interests, will polarize against them....Cultural freedom in Latin America is the freedom of the leading classes to approach their culture, while using it as an instrument to forbid the popular classes the right of expression...True cultural freedom does not exist within the concrete situations of domination where, in the best of cases, even a disguised power elite assumes a paternalistic role, thinking for and by the popular classes, which means against them. Cultural freedom is not a gift but the

conquered right of the popular classes to express themselves, an act which enables them to 'pronounce the world' and to live a continuous re-creation of it."

13. Giniger, Henry, "Mexican Center Trains New Kind of Priest for Latin America," The New York Times, (Dec. 26, 1965), p. 15. Illich: "We are training people to have a deep sense of humility, who will seek to make their faith relevant to the society in which they will be working, who will be sensitive to what ordinary people want, then in turn will be able to show them that, whatever they are fighting for, they can find a new dimension in human love."
14. Gray, Francine de Plessix. "Profiles: The Rules of the Game," The New Yorker, Vol. 46 (April 25, 1970), pp. 40-44. A biographical sketch of Illich. "Illich...had become one of the most admired, feared, and controversial priests in the American hemisphere....When Illich was asked recently to define his conception of grace, he replied, 'Another form of grace, in our time, can be attained through night school.' Illich believes deeply in adult education, and he would like to see all traditional school systems abolished, because, he says, they favor the privileged middle classes at the expense of marginal groups; only through a radically transformed system of adult education can the underprivileged rise from misery to the secular grace of enlightenment."
15. Illich, Ivan. "Puerto Ricans in New York," Commonweal, (June 22, 1956), pp. 294-297. "Spanish-Christian tradition, a Catholicism in which is taken for granted an eminently Christian attitude toward the mixing of races, a freshness and simplicity of outlook proper to the tropics, a new pattern of political freedom in association with the United States, a bridge between the hemispheres politically and culturally no less than economically -- these are only a few of the assets that the mass migration of Puerto Ricans to the mainland can contribute to New York and the United States." This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness as "Not Foreigners, yet Foreign."
16. Illich, Ivan. "The Seamy Side of Charity," America, Vol. 116, (Jan. 21, 1967), pp. 88-91. Subtitled: An authority on the Church in Latin America makes some blunt statements about American missionary work in South America. "When it (the Church) is threatened by real change, it withdraws rather than permit social awareness to spread like wildfire....The U.S. missionary tends to fulfill the traditional role of a colonial power's lackey chaplain." This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness.
17. Illich, Ivan. "The Vanishing Clergyman," The Critic, Vol. 25, No. 6, (June-July 1967), pp. 18-27. (This magazine is published by The Thomas More Association, 180 N. Wabash Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60601). This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness. "The Roman Church is the world's largest non-governmental bureaucracy. It employs 1.8 million full-time workers -- priests, brothers, sisters, and laymen....Men suspect that it has lost its relevance to the gospel and to the world. Wavering, doubt, and confusion reign among its directors, functionaries, and employees. The giant begins to totter before it collapses....I would like to suggest that we welcome the disappearance of institutional bureaucracy in a spirit of deep joy....The Church will discover new faith and power in the revealed word. It will teach through a living and intimate liturgy centered around this word. Small Christian communities will be nourished in its joyful celebration."

18. Illich, Ivan. "The Futility of Schooling in Latin America," Saturday Review, Vol. 51, (Apr. 20, 1968), pp. 57-59+. "A second, frequently discussed remedy for the failure of schools is fundamental, or adult, education. It has been proved by Paulo Freire in Brazil that those adults who can be interested in political issues of their community can be made literate within six weeks of evening classes. The program teaching such reading and writing skills, of course, must be built around the emotion-loaded key words of their political vocabulary. Understandably, this fact has gotten his program into trouble. It has been equally suggested that the dollar-cost of ten separate months of adult education is equal to one year of early schooling, and can be incomparably more effective than schooling at its best. Unfortunately, 'adult education' now is conceived principally as a device to give the 'underprivileged' a palliative for the schooling he lacks. The situation would have to be reviewed if we wanted to conceive of all education as an exercise in adulthood. We should consider a radical reduction of the length of the formal, obligatory school sessions to only two months each year -- but spread this type of formal schooling over the first twenty or thirty years of a man's life. While various forms of in-service apprenticeship in factories and programed math and language teaching could assume a large proportion of what we have previously called 'instruction'; two months a year of formal schooling should be ample time for what the Greeks meant by 'scholē' -- leisure for the pursuit of insight." This essay also appears in Celebration of Awareness as "The Futility of Schooling."
19. Illich, Ivan. "Violence: A Mirror for Americans," America, Vol. 118, (April 27, 1968), pp. 568-570. "I submit that foreign gods (ideals, idols, ideologies, persuasions, values) are more offensive to the 'poor' than the military or economic power of the foreigner....If I read present trends correctly, and I am confident I do, during the next few years violence will break out mostly against symbols of foreign ideas and the attempt to sell these. And I fear that this violence, which is fundamentally a healthy though angry and turbulent rejection of alienating symbols, will be exploited and will harden into hatred and crime." This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness.
20. Illich, Ivan. "Outwitting the 'Developed' Countries," New York Review of Books, date? Pages? Also appears as "Planned Poverty: The End Result of Technical Assistance" in Celebration of Awareness. "The World is reaching an impasse where two processes converge: ever more men have fewer basic choices. The increase in population is widely publicized and creates panic. The decrease in fundamental choice causes anguish and is consistently overlooked. The population explosion overwhelms the imagination, but the progressive atrophy of social imagination is rationalized as an increase of choice between brands. The two processes converge in a dead end: the population explosion provides more consumers for everything from food to contraceptives, while our shrinking imagination can conceive of no other ways of satisfying their demands except through the packages now on sale in the admired societies....The intense promotion of schooling leads to so close an identification of school attendance

and education that in everyday language the two terms are interchangeable. Once the imagination of an entire population has been 'schooled,' or indoctrinated to believe that school has a monopoly on formal education, then the illiterate can be taxed to provide free high school and university education for the children of the rich....The only feasible answer to ever increasing underdevelopment is a response to basic needs that is planned as a long-range goal for areas which will always have a different capital structure. It is easier to speak about alternatives to existing institutions, services, and products than to define them with precision. It is not my purpose either to paint a Utopia or to engage in scripting scenarios for an alternate future. We must be satisfied with examples indicating simple directions that research should take....I am calling for research on alternatives to the products which now dominate the market; to hospitals and the profession dedicated to keeping the sick alive; to schools and the packaging process which refuses education to those who are not of the right age, who have not gone through the right curriculum, who have not sat in a classroom a sufficient number of successive hours, who will not pay for their learning with submission to custodial care, screening, and certification or with indoctrination in the values of the dominate elite.....Money is now spent largely on children, but an adult can be taught to read in one-tenth the time and for one-tenth the cost it takes to teach a child. In the case of the adult there is an immediate return on the investment, whether the main importance of his learning is seen in his new insight, political awareness, and willingness to assume responsibility for his family's size and future, or whether the emphasis is placed on increased production. There is a double return in the case of the adult, because not only can he contribute to the education of his children, but to that of other adults as well. In spite of these advantages, basic literacy programs have little or no support in Latin America, where schools have a first call on all public resources. Worse, these programs are actually ruthlessly suppressed in Brazil and elsewhere, where military support of the feudal or industrial oligarchy has thrown off its former benevolent disguise."

21. Illich, Ivan. "Monsignor Illich's Letter to Cardinal Seper." America, Vol. 120, (Feb. 15, 1969), pp. 187-189. Illich's letter written June 18, 1968 after he was called to Rome and an attempt was made to interrogate him in secret.
22. Illich, Ivan. "La Metamorfosis de la escuela," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 1, (1970). pp. 4-11. Spanish text of Illich's commencement address to the University of Puerto Rico, June 6, 1969. (An English translation is available, without charge, by writing to Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5 Ontario.) A slightly different form of this address appears as "Commencement at the University of Puerto Rico" in the New York Review of Books magazine, and as "School: The Sacred Cow" in Illich's book Celebration of Awareness. "The 'age of schooling' began about two hundred years ago. Gradually the idea grew that schooling was a necessary means of becoming a useful member of society. It is the task of this generation to bury that myth....I expect that by the end of this century, what we now call school will be a historical relic, developed in the time of the railroad and the private automobile and discarded along with them. I feel sure that it will soon be evident that the school is as marginal to education as the witch doctor is to public health...There is no intrinsic reason why the education that schools are now failing to

provide could not be acquired more successfully in the setting of the family, of work, and communal activity, in new kinds of libraries and other centers that would provide the means of learning. But the institutional forms that education will take in tomorrow's society cannot be clearly visualized. Neither could any of the great reformers anticipate concretely the institutional styles that would result from their reforms. The fear that new institutions will be imperfect in their turn, does not justify our servile acceptance of present ones.....The basic purpose of public education should be to create a situation in which society obliges each individual to take stock of himself and his poverty. Education implies a growth of an independent sense of life and a relatedness which go hand in hand with increased access to, and use of, memories stored in the human community. The educational institution provides the focus for this process. This presupposes a place within the society in which each of us is awakened by surprise; a place of encounter in which others surprise me with their liberty and make me aware of my own...My friends, it is your task to surprise yourselves, and us, with the education you succeed in inventing for your children. Our hope of salvation lies in our being surprised by the Other. Let us learn always to receive further surprises. I decided long ago to hope for surprises until the final act of my life -- that is to say, in death itself."

23. Illich, Ivan. 1970 Beecher Lectures. These lectures were read at the Divinity School of Yale University on February 16-18, 1970. They have been printed in pamphlet form by the Center for Intercultural Documentation "for the exclusive use of participants in El Ciclo, Spring Term 1970" as CIDOC Cardeno No. 1002, 1970. (They may be available at \$2.00 from Center for Intercultural Documentation, APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor, Mexico.) Since my copy of these lectures is marked "Not for publication -- Private" it would not seem appropriate to quote from them here. It appears likely that much of the material will appear in the book Deschooling Society (see bibliographic item below under that title). However, it is important to point out that these lectures reveal that Illich is not caught up in the typical view of education (as opposed to schooling) as primarily an activity of 'childhood.' In fact, he questions the worth of the very concept "childhood." His natural acceptance of the view that education is properly a "lifelong" activity (without using such cliches as "lifelong" or "lifelong learning") makes his writings, including these lectures, of great interest to adult educators.
24. Illich, Ivan. A videotape was made early in 1970 of a lecture given at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. It is on  $\frac{1}{2}$  inch Shibaden. (For information on availability write to Mr. Reg Herman, Managing Editor, Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.)
25. Illich, Ivan. "Why We Must Abolish Schooling," New York Review of Books, Vol. 15, No. 1, (July 2, 1970), pp. 9-15. "The most radical alternative to school would be a network or service which gives each man the same opportunity to share his current concern with others motivated by the same concern...Both the exchange of skills and matching of partners are based on

the assumption that education for all means education by all....We must learn to measure the social value of work and leisure by the educational give-and-take for which they offer opportunity. Effective participation in the politics of a street, a work place, the library, a news program or hospital is therefore the best measuring stick to evaluate their level as educational institutions." Drawn from The Beecher Lectures.

26. Illich, Ivan "Ivan Illich Writes Pope Paul," Commonweal, Vol. XCII, No. 18, (Sept. 4, 1970), pp. 428-429. "Holy Father: I must censure your silence. Respectfully, firmly and publicly I must do so. For two years, it has been your duty to speak out against systematic torture of its political prisoners by the military government of Brazil with the same vehement indignation with which you have denounced the killing by Uruguayan insurgents of an American police technician. You have failed in this duty, just as you have again and again refused to speak out personally against specific acts of inhumanity on the part of men who are in government and power in Latin America....I do not claim that my personal vocation to pacifism gives me the right to condemn others who do not share it, who have chosen the way of violence: the policeman, the soldier, the rebel. But I do claim the right -- I recognize my duty -- to single out specific deeds that I hear cry to heaven, deeds that do violence to the decency that even their perpetrators claim to honor....Your humble and obedient servant, Ivan Illich."
27. Illich, Ivan. Ciclo Lectures Summer, 1970. Cuernavaca, Mexico: CIDOC 1970. (Order at \$4.000 from CIDOC, APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor. Mexico) Eight essays prepared, among other reasons, "to provide material for discussion during the four-month term on Alternatives in Education which will gather several hundred people in Cuernavaca between January and April 1971." Includes "Why We Must Abolish Schooling" from July 2, 1970 New York Review of Books and a part of the Beecher Lectures 1970. In addition, one essay "The Ritualization of Progress" is similar to "Schooling: The Ritual of Progress" in the Dec. 3, 1970 issue of the New York Review of Books. The other five essays are "The Dawn of Epimethean Man," "The Institutional Spectrum," "Fragments for the Left Hand," "Four Educational Networks," and "Dissidence, Deviance and Delinquency in Style." "Man has developed the frustrating omnipotence to be unable to demand anything because he also cannot visualize anything which an institution cannot do for him. Surrounded by omnipotent tools, man is reduced to a tool of his tools. Each of the institutions meant to exorcise one of the primeval evils has become a fail-safe self-sealing coffin for man....If we opt for more and better instruction, society will move toward domination by a sinister school and totalitarian teachers. Doctors, generals and policemen will continue to serve as secular arms for the educator. There will be no winners in the deadly game, but only exhausted frontrunners, a straining middle sector and the mass of stragglers who must be bombed out of their fields into the rat race of urban life....A good educational institution is one whose operation sets into motion the demand for no more than its minimum use. Access to school comes only in large chunks. Even when the curriculum is highly flexible and permits all kinds of nibbling, the decision to bite in always implies self-definition as a student for a substantial and definitive period of time. The desirable educational institution would facilitate use at any time and for any amount....The school planner puts people together into classes. The educational planner builds channels that can be used to put resources together in unlimited combinations. Schools use resources to provide time, space, motivation and company for selected

persons, and to make them share in a package of educational processes called a curriculum. An ideal learning network allows access to all resources which fit on its channels for all learners at all moments of their lives....To de-school means to abolish the power of one man to oblige another man to attend a meeting. It also means recognizing the right of any man, of any age, to call a meeting. This right has been drastically diminished by the institutionalization of meetings. 'Meeting' originally referred to the result of an act of gathering. Now it is a substantive referring to the institutional product of some agency."

28. Illich, Ivan. "The False Ideology of Schooling," Saturday Review, (October 17, 1970), pp. 56-58+. Reprinted from Great Ideas Today-1970 published by Encyclopaedia Britannica. "The cultural revolutionary risks the future on the educability of man." Also appears in Celebration of Awareness as "A Constitution for Cultural Revolution." In the Saturday Review about three paragraphs are cut out at the end.
29. Illich, Ivan. "Should We Abolish Our Schools?" Weekend Magazine, (Oct. 24, 1970), pp. 10-13. (This publication is available from P.O. Box 1538, Place d'Armes, Montreal 126, Quebec, Canada.) Illich adapts his ideas to the Canadian scene. "Education is a matter of helping someone find his own way, with the help of lessons already learned, but without the process being dictated by the established wisdom. I can think of no better way of doing this than by bringing people together around the title of a book, record, article or film about which they want to know more...The idea of getting people together to exchange skills and knowledge presumes that we are willing to mobilize all the educational resources of a society, instead of pretending that they are locked up inside the school. It implies a commitment to making the world an educational place to grow up in. Certainly, work would have to be redefined in terms of its educational value. Education would also have to be conceived as the whole process of growing up, and not something with a beginning and an end measured by school age. We have made education into a process which is preparatory to, rather than a continuing part of, life -- a process which follows patterns predetermined by educators and which is measured as successful in terms that have nothing to do with what is known. To bring about an educational revolution will require that men stop putting such a high price on access to a society. We are all considerably less than we think school has made us, though we owe much of our privilege and power to our successful running of the school race. We must recover our manhood and invent ways to share it freely."
30. Illich, Ivan. Celebration of Awareness: A Call for Institutional Revolution. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Co., 1970. 189 pages. (Available at \$5.95 from Doubleday & Co., 501 Franklin Avenue, Garden City, New York 11531.) Gathered here are some of Illich's "occasional writings" presented as originally given but with brief introductory statements. Introduction by Erich Fromm. Four not previously published items appear here: "A Call to Celebration," a manifesto presented at the time of the "March on the Pentagon" in 1967 ("In order to persuade the citizen that he controls his destiny, that morality informs decisions, and that technology is the servant rather

than the driving force, it is necessary today to distort information. The ideal of informing the public has given way to trying to convince the public that forced actions are actually desirable actions....The celebration of man's humanity through joining together in the healing expression of one's relationships with others, and one's growing acceptance of one's own nature and needs, will clearly create major confrontations with existing values and systems. The expanding dignity of each man and each human relationship must necessarily challenge existing systems;"; "The Eloquence of Silence," some "points for meditation" presented to a Spanish language workshop in the 1950's ("The pregnant pauses between sounds and utterances become luminous points in an incredible void: as electrons in the atom, as planets in the solar system.... With Confucius we can see language as a wheel. The spokes centralize, but the empty spaces make the wheel."); "The Powerless Church," a speech on the role of the church in social change and development delivered to a conference of Anglican church secretaries for social action in April 1967 ("Social innovation is becoming an increasingly complex process. Innovative action must be taken with increasing frequency and sophistication. This requires men who are courageous, dedicated, willing to lose their careers. I believe that this innovative action will increasingly be taken by groups committed to radically humanist ideals, and not gospel authority, and should therefore not be taken by churches....We will need ideological rationalizations for a long time to achieve purposefully planned inventive solutions to social problems. Let consciously secular ideology assume this task. I want to celebrate my faith for no purpose at all."); and "Sexual Power and Political Power," a speech given to a meeting of population experts in 1967 ("Within the present political and social context, it is impossible to induce the majority of the people to adopt birth control. Neither seduction nor current efforts at education work. To seduce effectively, the marketing of birth control would have to become more aggressive: twenty-five dollars offered for the insertion of each coil, one hundred dollars for each sterilization. To educate effectively, governments would be promoting their own subversion through sudden and widespread adult education. For it is clear that the education that enables adults to formulate their own dissent risks the loss of all constraints on freedom and imagination....My suggestion to orient large-scale formal educational programs for adults intensively toward family planning implies a commitment in favor of a political education. The struggle for political liberation and popular participation in Latin America can be rooted in new depth and awareness if it will spring from the recognition that, even in the most intimate domains of life, modern man must accept technology as a condition. Conducted in this style, education to modern parenthood could become a powerful form of agitation to help an uprooted mass grow into 'people'.")

31. Illich, Ivan. Alternatives in Education. Audio-tape: About two hours. (Order at \$5.00 from Reg Herman, Managing Editor, Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada) This is a tape of a lecture delivered by Illich at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education on December 2, 1970. The chairman of the meeting announced that he had been informed by Illich that this was the last time he would talk on education and that he now hopes to move on to other things and leave the problems of education to other people or people he had managed to convert. Illich: 'What we now call 'the crisis in education' is mostly a result of an effort to make the facts of life as we live them fit into our dogma that schools are necessary,

mainly because 'the poor ought to be put into schools.' We believe that people will not find time or motivation to learn unless they are either bribed or compelled. The more we are liberals and concerned with people, the more we are convinced that the poorer a person is the more he must be bribed or compelled to submit to our educational treatment....The aim of the de-schooling of society must not be confused with two trends which are critical of the school system and, which though opposed, only seek to substitute schools....Let me call the first trend of those who want simply to substitute schools, the Jacobins, and the second one, the Bourbons. The Jacobin educator would seek to expand his right to teach everywhere, to teach far beyond the scholastic district. He would make us depend more on planned and engineered processes in learning and deliver his services more persuasively through channels which touch us more intimately than a seat in a classroom -- media of all kinds. He would escalate the public reliance on the knowledge industry and further discredit the auto-didact, the self-learner. His alternative to school is the attempt to transform society into a classroom, into a school.....The Bourbon wants to substitute the vulgar universal schools of the Jacobin with more selective ones for the elite of his choosing....Now my ideal is exactly the opposite of what both the Bourbons and the Jacobins propose....I trust men constantly to use their hearts and their brains. I want to live in a transparent society in which each moment of life is surprising and with meaningful participation in mutual education. I want to live in mutual education up to the moment, and in the moment, of my death. I see human perfection in the progressive elimination of the institutional intermediary between man and the truth which he wants 'o learn.'" Approximately the last half of the tape is devoted to a question and answer session with the audience. The tape is seven inch, 3 3/4 i.p.s. half-track.

32. Illich, Ivan. A videotape was made late in 1970 of a lecture delivered at York University. (For information on availability write to Mr. Art Knowles, Director, Instructional Aid Resources, York University, Keele Street, Downsview, Ontario, Canada.)
33. Illich, Ivan. "Schooling: The Ritual of Progress," New York Review of Books, Vol. 15, No. 10, (Dec. 3, 1970), pp. 20-25. "The school-leaving age in developed nations outpaces the rise in life expectancy. The two curves will intersect in a decade and create a problem for Jessica Mitford and professionals concerned with 'terminal education'....No one completes school -- yet. It never closes its doors on anyone without first offering him one more chance: at remedial, adult, and continuing education....A whole society is initiated into the Myth of Unending Consumption of services. This happens to the degree that token participation in the open-ended ritual is made compulsory and compulsive everywhere. School directs ritual rivalry into an international game which obliges competitors to blame the world's ills on those who cannot or will not play....The totally destructive and constantly progressive nature of obligatory instruction will fulfill its ultimate logic unless we begin to liberate ourselves right now from our pedagogical hubris, our belief that man can do what God cannot, namely manipulate others for their own salvation." This article will appear in a different form in De-Schooling Society.

34. Illich, Ivan. "Education Without School: How It Can Be Done," New York Review of Books, Vol. 15, No. 12, (Jan. 7, 1971), pp. 25-31. A different form of this article will appear in De-Schooling Society. "The alternative to dependence on schools is not the use of public resources for some new device which 'makes' people learn; rather it is the creation of a new style of educational relationship between man and his environment....In this essay, I intend to show that the inverse of school is possible: That we can depend on self-motivated learning instead of employing teachers to bribe or compel the student to find time and the will to learn; that we can provide the learner with new links to the world instead of continuing to funnel all educational programs through the teacher....A good educational system should have three purposes: it should provide all who want to learn with access to available resources at any time in their lives; empower all who want to share what they know to find those who want to learn it from them; and finally, furnish all who want to present an issue to the public with the opportunity to make their challenge known."
35. Illich, Ivan. De-Schooling Society. Book to be published in May 1971 by Harper & Row Publishers Inc., 49 E. 33rd Street, New York, New York 10016, in their World Perspective series.
36. Illich, Ivan and John Ogley. Yesterday I Could Not Sleep Because Yesterday I Wrote My Name. Audio-Tape. 42 minutes, 9 seconds. (Order as Tape #299 from the Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, P.O. 4446, Santa Barbara, California 93103. Price: \$7.50. Available either on five-inch 3 3/4 i.p.s. half track tapes or on cassettes. Free study guide available with tape on request.) Illich: "Schools mostly render people capable of receiving instruction from industry and from authority. That's the best thing they do....Paulo Freire, I consider as my teacher....Of course, Paulo Freire today is an exile as practically every adult educator in Latin America at this moment is in exile or in jail or some other way restrained.... Education is a political concept....Fundamental education is the key to control of political power....I do believe that it would be a grave mistake to plan revolutionary strategy on a Leninist model, that it is really just necessary to see how my group rather than the other has control over the major value-oriented institutions of society....It is much more effective to rethink the alienated aspects of the most highly valued institution -- the school.... What we have to achieve over the next three to five years is a great sense of humor and of ridicule related to that particular religious institution, which is the universal, not church but, school....We must begin by saying that in the name of education we want to get rid of the school."
37. Illich, Ivan and Donald McDonald and Denis Goulet. A Privileged Place Audio-tape. 21 minutes, 20 seconds. (Order as Tape #483 at \$7.50 from The Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, P.O. Box 4446, Santa Barbara, California 93103. Available on either five-inch 3 3/4 i.p.s. half-track or on cassettes. Study guide available free with tape on request.) A segment from a long conversation recorded at the Santa Barbara Center where Illich talked with Donald McDonald and Denis Goulet about the role of the Catholic Church in Latin America, how it functions and how it should function. Illich: "I do not believe that my knowledge that when I'm speaking to you, speaking to a brother, in the God-man, to a member of the Church, and if I speak to him who is not consciously a Christian, I'm still speaking to a man redeemed, changes anything, and may ever change anything, in the orientation which our planning for different educational systems will take."

38. "Ivan Illich," in Current Biography, 1969. pp. 217-220. Biographical sketch with quotations from a number of articles about Illich.
39. "Msgr. Illich Leaves Priesthood," Christian Century, (April 16, 1969), p. 503. "Msgr. Ivan Illich has 'irrevocably' resigned from the Catholic priesthood. The controversial priest, who in 1961 founded the Cuernavaca center with the sponsorship of the late Francis Cardinal Spellman, has been under heavy criticism by Vatican officials in recent months, and last January the center itself was banned to all priests and nuns by the Vatican. Summoned to the Vatican and confronted with a long list of questions about his theological and political views, Msgr. Illich refused to take an oath of secrecy and declined to answer the questions on the ground that they were prejudicially stated. His stand was supported by the National Catholic Reporter and other Catholic journals and by several Catholic canon lawyers. Msgr. Illich's resignation extends to the title of 'monsignor' and to the rights of a priest to say mass, preach, hear confessions and administer sacraments. However he will continue as a celibate and as director of the center."
40. "Paulo Freire," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 3 (1970). In Spanish. (English translation available without charge from Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.) The article is abstracted from a report of the American Universities Field Staff, Inc., by Thomas G. Sanders, and from Terre Souterre, Paris, March-April, 1969. "Observers in Latin America no longer think of learning to read as acquiring mere technical skill, but as a process implying values, forming mentalities and leading to social and political consequences. The chief intellectual architect of this change is a Brazilian named Paulo Freire." Freire is quoted as saying: "Education is an act of love and for that very reason, an act of courage. It cannot fear debate and analysis of reality. It cannot flee from creative discussions for fear of being farcical....It is not possible, with an autocratic education, to mould men who will play an active role in the exciting process of developing a democracy: such education is directly opposed to the emergence of a people into public life."
41. "People Not In the News: Monsignor Ivan Illich," Ramparts, Vol. 6, (June 15, 1968), p. 15. "Left-wing Catholic priests wearing Black Power tee shirts were passing out copies of Ivan Illich's essay 'The Vanishing Clergyman' last summer like they were holy cards....Only a year ago last February, Cardinal Cushing, head of the U.S. Bishops' Committee for Latin America, pounded a Catholic podium and lambasted as a 'colossal lie' an essay of Illich's, 'The Seamy Side of Charity.'....Illich describes his secular institute (CIDOC) as a 'thinkery.'....The Center, says Msgr. Illich, is the 'only successful free university.'"
42. Relmer, Everett. A videotape was made early in 1970 of a lecture given at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. It is on 1 inch Sony. (For information on availability write to Mr. Reg Herman, Managing Editor, Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.)

43. Reimer, Everett. An Essay on Alternatives in Education. Cuernavaca, Mexico: Center for Intercultural Documentation, 1970. (Available free by writing to the Center at APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor, Mexico.) Contents include: Why Alternatives to School? What Schools Do. What Schools Are. The History of Schooling. Schools and Other Institutions. What Kinds of Alternatives? Learning, Training and Education. Educational Resources. Allocation of Educational Resources. The Revolutionary Role of Education. Strategy for a Peaceful Revolution.
44. Roman Catholics: 'Get Going and Don't Come Back.' Time, (Feb. 14, 1969), pp. 48+. Description of Illich's trials and tribulations with the Catholic hierarchy. 'The confrontation was inevitable....There is at least a hint that the Illich affair was more than a little disturbing to Rome.'
45. Schrag, Peter. 'Ivan Illich: The Christian as Rebel,' Saturday Review (July 19, 1969), pp. 14-19. 'In his (Illich's) vision any genuine education tends to be political and revolutionary, and any real learning to be subversive. Birth control programs in Latin America have failed, Illich said, because they require forms of adult education that inevitably have political consequences and are therefore unwelcome to the military governments of the hemisphere. 'The political order cannot tolerate too much awareness, originality, and risk. Education of adults which is analytical and dialectic leads inevitably to a liberation from taboos. Idols cannot be knocked off selectively....The awareness that sex does not have to lead to unwanted motherhood provokes another: the insight that economic survival does not have to breed political exploitation. The freedom of the mate and the citizen lead over the same road.' Real adult education is far more radical than training guerrillas. Schooling on the other hand, teaches acquiescence.'

#### OTHER ITEMS OF INTEREST

46. Cass, James. "The Crisis of Confidence -- and Beyond," Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 61-62. "Perhaps it is true that the schools cannot change until society itself is reformed. Perhaps the public school mystique is dead and we have, indeed, come to the end of an impossible dream. But it is also possible that the schools can play a role in that reformation of society, that we can put it all back together again and restore faith in the schools as the cornerstone of a democratic society. The task of the Seventies is to find out."
47. Chisholm, Brock. Can People Learn to Learn? How to Know Each Other. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1958. 143 pages (If still in print order from Harper & Row Publishers, Inc., 49 E. 33rd Street, New York, New York 10016 as Volume 18 in the World Perspectives Series.) Chisholm has been Director General of the World Health Organization. From the jacket: "Here is a bold, challenging demand for new habits of education and thinking to meet the world-wide dangers of the present day. Chisholm makes a convincing argument against the local, national, religious and parental taboos which cloud so many minds. Discussing a number of Eastern and Western countries, he illustrates the barriers created by language, cultures and political institutions. Certain to be controversial, this book is equally certain to impress many as a fresh, vitally important critique of society in this century."
48. Cotton, Webster E. "A New Direction for Adult Education," Educational Horizons, (Summer, 1968) "We can only ask ourselves: What happened to adult education? How did this noble vision become transformed into a thriving system of adult education which is irrelevant to the fate of man in the modern world? This is a question with much broader implications than adult education. It is a dilemma that plagues our whole society. As a matter of fact, a number of social critics have directed attention to this dilemma. It has to do with the conflict between our ideals and our practice; the gap between what we say and what we do; the confusion between illusion and reality....In its brief sojourn on the American scene, adult education seems to have fallen prey to 'the American dilemma.' On the one hand, we have allowed our 'idealistic' intentions to be replaced by 'pragmatic' considerations. Once adult education entered the marketplace, it began to take on the trappings of the marketplace -- the overriding concern with the immediate and the practical; the emphasis on the quantitative, the number of students enrolled, the number of programs offered, and so forth; the desire to be 'successful,' defined in terms of prestige, big budgets, and so forth....However, hand in hand with this development has gone a much more sinister one. It involves the failure to recognize what has happened to adult education in the market place. For all practical purposes, adult 'education' has been converted into adult training -- vocational and utilitarian training. But most of us have refused to accept this reality; we have preferred the illusion that what is carried on as 'adult education' is, in fact, adult education. We don't want to accept the fact that the noble ideals of 'the founding fathers' in adult education have 'gone down the drain'; we don't want to accept the fact that 'adult education,' as currently practiced, is irrelevant to the fate of man in the modern world. How do we go about

moving adult education in a new direction? How do we make it relevant to the fate of man in the modern world? These are the big questions; these are the questions we must come to grips with. And yet, we have not even been asking these questions; let alone, trying to answer them. We have not been asking them because we have come to accept the prevailing system of 'adult education.' To ask these questions would involve calling into question the whole system. This we dare not do. What confronts adult educators, as well as all educators, is a very real predicament. The conditions of the times seem to demand that we challenge the very system that sustains us and gives 'meaning' (of a dubious quality) to our lives. So, we arrive at a point, where most discussions of this type eventually lead, to a question of personal decision. Will the individual adult educator (or educator) have the courage to raise the questions that must be raised? And then, will he be willing to take that action which is called for? In terms of the times in which we live, this not a duty, it is only a necessity." This article is condensed in Adult Leadership, Vol. 18, No. 3, (Sept. 1969), p. 80 (Free reprints of the full article are available by writing to Professor Webster Cotton, Education Department, California State College at Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California.)

49. Cunningham, Luvern L. "Key, Man You Our Principal?: Urban Education as I Saw It," Phi. Delta Kappan, Vol. LI, No. 3, (Nov. 1969), pp. 123-128. From the editor's introduction: "Last May 12 principals from a Midwest city system exchanged positions briefly with a number of professors and administrators from the College of Education, Ohio State University....The dean of the OSU College of Education, who had volunteered for the exchange, was assigned to what is generally regarded as the most difficult school in the cooperating system." Cunningham: "I arrived about 7:45 a.m. I had read about the city's riots in 1966 and knew it was near here that they had started. I was aware too that this was a junior high that had been having its share of trouble....The cancer of hate is latent within the student body. You sense its power. You sense its presence and the prospect for its release at any moment. You do not know when it will burst forth and cascade around you....Systems should depress the emphasis on attendance. I would even support abandoning compulsory education for this part of the city. Emphasize programs of interest and attractiveness; de-emphasize regimentation... It is clear that we have no experts in this sort of urban education anywhere... No one has the answer. Anyone who thinks he has is a fool....Such educational institutions are an indictment of presidents and senators; of justices and teachers; of governors and legislators. It is ludicrous the way we behave. Our pathetic politicians wailing and wringing their hands, spouting platitudes and diatribes. They say that bold acts will not find favor with unnamed constituencies. And we educators stand impotent, frightened, disheveled in the face of such tragedy."
50. Deloria, Vine, Jr., We Talk, You Listen: New Tribes, New Turf. New York, New York 10022: The Macmillan Co., 866 Third Avenue, 1970. 227 pp. \$5.95. Don't be misled by the fact that this book is by an American Indian who also wrote Custer Died for Your Sins. From what I have read, it seems to me that this book partakes of Illich's call for "sarcasm...to smile the social system apart." "Liberalism has lost its credibility. It no longer catches up the spirit of the times. Where the conservative is reactionary the liberal is reactive. The liberal waits for movements to occur and then either casually, self-righteously, and unconsciously buys them up or frantically tries to relate to them. The conservative views anything with suspicion. To him even the subway is subversive because it is, after all,

an underground movement. The liberal waits to find out if someone else thinks the subway is good or bad, and then pounces on the most popular viewpoint, accepting it as his own and lashing out self-righteously at those who disagree with him... Indians should be ecstatic that the days of the liberal are waning. No other group has suffered as much at the hands of liberals as have Indians. Where whites 'believe' in equality and are active in civil rights when they relate to the black community, they have been 'interested' in Indians. It is rather like the way I am interested in collecting coins or someone else is interested in postage stamps... In the past, whenever an Indian did something significant, like support some white liberal's program for Indians, the liberal stated that the Indian was a 'credit to his race.' This accolade was almost comparable to being named chief -- and everyone knows how dear that is to the Indian soul... As the influence of liberals has declined, the significance of many events has also lessened. When poverty was discovered, the 'do-good' element jumped into the fray with the enthusiasm of Prince Valiant swinging his 'singing sword.' Flying to and fro from conference to conference the liberals filled the world with the sound of airplanes, where it was formerly occupied with music. Now rumor has it that United Airlines may have to mothball half of its fleet as the desperate urge to confer begins to ebb... Because the liberal always took it upon himself to speak for and about the various

racial minorities, issues which affected all racial groups were always interpreted to each group as if they shared a common burden. In fact they did share a common burden -- the liberal. His style and language have served to divide people rather than bring them together.... There is no doubt in my mind that a major crisis exists. I believe, however, that it is deeper and more profound than racism, violence, and economic deprivation. American society is undergoing a total replacement of its philosophical concepts. Words are being emptied of old meanings and new values are coming in to fill the vacuum. Racial antagonisms, inflation, ecological destruction, and power groups are all symptoms of the emergence of a new world view of man and his society. Today thought patterns are shifting from the traditional emphasis on the solitary individual to as yet unrelated definitions of man as a member of a specific group.... It would appear to me that modern society has two alternatives at this point. American people are being pushed into new social forms because of the complex nature of modern communications and transportation, and the competing forms of neo-tribalism and neofeudalism. The contest of the future is between a return to the castle or the tipi. The difference between the castle and the tipi is immense, yet there are such great similarities that it is difficult to distinguish between them. Each offers social identity and economic security within a definite communal system. But the leveling process of the tribal form prevents the hereditary control over a social pyramid, and the feudalistic form has the efficiency to create and control technology. Both are needed if we are to rule machines instead of submit to them.... With the negation of traditional Western values the chances of a revival of Indians and Mexicans through nationalistic movements have considerably increased. Being non-Western and instinctively oriented toward group values, they can now bring their special genius to bear on their problems. But they must hurry. With militant young blacks and disenchanted white youth rapidly forming combinations on the tribal-clan basis, Indians and Mexicans may well miss the nationalistic boat. They run the risk of being the last middle-class people in the United States."

51. Domhoff, G. William. Who Rules America? Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1967. 184 pp. (Available as a Spectrum paperback at \$2.45 from Spectrum Books % Prentice-Hall, Inc., Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey 07632.) "Control of America's leading universities by members of the American business aristocracy is more direct than with any other institution which they control....Upper-class control of major universities is achieved through financial support as family endowments (e.g., Duke, Stanford, Vanderbilt), personal gifts, foundation gifts, and corporate gifts, and through service on the boards of trustees. These mechanisms give the upper class control of the broad framework, the long-run goals, and the general atmosphere of the university....As might be expected, members of the American business aristocracy stressed technical and practical training in the universities they influenced, as opposed to traditional classical education....The relationship between the corporate rich and academia is best exemplified by a school such as the University of Rochester. Most of the university's board is made up of officers of such Rochester-based corporations as Eastman Kodak, Xerox, and Taylor Instrument. The chairman of the board, who is also the president of Xerox, explained the relationship as follows: 'To put it as crassly as possible, it's a matter of sheer self-interest -- dollars and cents. Xerox will live or die by technology.'"
52. Domhoff, G. William. The Higher Circles: The Governing Class in America. New York: Random House, Inc., 1970. 367 pp (Available at \$7.95 from Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022.) "Social mobility is not central to the study of the American upper class of the twentieth century. For students of the upper class, the findings on the small amount of movement into the upper class are interesting because they provide a basis for re-evaluating the efforts of the upper-class publicists and upper-class historians. They also cast doubt on the value of the claim that rapid social mobility has inhibited the development of class consciousness or cohesion in the highest stratum of American society....Moderate leaders within the upper class, somewhat restrained by their more conservative brethren, have made the key decisions of the twentieth century; these moderate leaders have been helped in every area -- foreign policy, domestic policy, propaganda and espionage -- by a small number of highly-respected academic experts who are situated in a handful of prestigious and richly endowed universities....The American upper class is a governing class, by which I mean a social upper class which owns a disproportionate amount of the country's wealth, receives a disproportionate share of the country's yearly income, contributes a disproportionate number of its members to governmental bodies and decision-making groups, and dominates the policy-forming process through a variety of means....The governing class manifests itself through a power elite which is its operating arm."
53. Domhoff, G. William and Hoyt B. Ballard, Editors. C. Wright Mills and The Power Elite. Boston: Beacon Press, 1968. 278 pp. This compilation contains two essays on Mills as a man and as a sociologist; eleven critiques of The Power Elite by such "Liberal," "Radical," or "Highbrow" critics as Talcott Parsons, A.A. Berle, Jr., Robert S. Lynd, Herbert Aptheker, Richard Rovere,

and Daniel Bell; Mills' own reply to reviews of his book; and a final essay by Domhoff "to provide comment on the later reviews (not covered by Mills), and to survey the discussion from a perspective of ten years and recent research." Domhoff concludes: "With or without alterations and qualifications, The Power Elite stands as tall in the light of recent events as it did in 1956 when it crashed in on the Great American Celebration with its detailed description and provocative indictment of the structure of power in modern America. Not only did it present a new conception of how the United States is ruled, but it forced pluralists and Marxists to rethink, make explicit, and defend their own positions. It is a landmark of political sociology that will be read with more than mere historical interest for many years to come, a beacon to the intellectual craftsmen on whom Mills placed his hopes for the rational and human world he passionately sought."

54. Douglas, William O. Points of Rebellion. New York: Vintage Books, 1970. 97 pp. (Paperback edition available at \$1.95 from Vintage Books, % Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022.) "The universities should be completely freed from CIA and from Pentagon control, through grants of money or otherwise. Faculties and students should have the basic controls so that the university will be a revolutionary force that helps shape the restructuring of society. A university should not be an adjunct of business, nor of the military, nor of government. Its curriculum should teach change, not the status quo. Then, the dialogue between the people and the powers-that-be can start; and it may possibly keep us all from being victims of the corporate state."
55. Duberman, Martin. "An Experiment in Education," in The Uncompleted Past, by Martin Duberman. New York: Random House, 1969. 3/4 pp (Available at \$7.95 from Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022.) "The entire superstructure of authoritarian control in our schools must give way if we are to enable people to assume responsibility for and to take pleasure in their own lives. We cannot expect aliveness and involvement when we are busy inculcating docility and compliance. In this regard, the false distinctions that separate student from teacher must be broken down. What do we think titles like 'professor,' 'sir,' or 'mister' achieve? Perhaps the illusion of respect, but certainly not its reality.... The simple dualism which pretends that education is concerned solely with 'informing the mind,' and therapy with 'understanding the emotions' falsifies our everyday experience. No one actually functions on the basis of such neat categories; our emotions always color our intellectual views, and our minds are continually 'ordering' our emotional responses....(I continue to use outmoded, dualistic terminology like intellectual and emotional because more accurate vocabulary is not yet available.)"
56. Duberman, Martin. "Review of Silberman's 'Crisis In the Classroom.'" The New York Times Book Review, (Sept. 20, 1970), pp.9+. "His book is a formidable indictment of all levels of education in this country....It is Silberman who has reminded us that whenever anyone discusses the 'aims of education,' he is inescapably dealing in the basic question, 'What kind of human beings and what kind of society do we want to produce'....Men like Neill and Holt have made more of an effort than Silberman to outline the premises and examine the ramifications of the particular model of human

behavior implicit in their work. Most of Silberman's energies have gone instead to detailing the current horrors of the schools. And on that level, no book has done a better job."

57. Farber, Jerry. The Student as Nigger. New York: Pocket Books, 1969. 142 pp. (Paperback available at \$1.10 from Pocket Books, 1 West 39th Street, New York, New York 10018). According to the author the title essay of this book of essays has been reprinted in about 500 publications, "two high-school teachers in the Los Angeles area were fired on the spot for reading it to their classes, "campus editors who have reprinted it have routinely been called on the administration carpet," but "I have received scarcely any criticism from students on the article." "Students are society's slaves and teachers are no more than overseers. It's a mistake to get hung up exclusively in a struggle against teachers just as it's a mistake to let one's anger toward ghetto cops obscure the larger threat of the racist society that pays their salary and buys their bullets....Democracy in school doesn't mean that we vote on what's true; it means that education isn't anything which is done to somebody....Learning isn't a duty that we must be flogged into performing; it's our birthright, our very human specialty and joy. Places to learn are everywhere. So are reasons to learn. All we need, occasionally, is a little help from our friends....There is a kind of castration that goes on in schools. It begins before school years with parents' first encroachments on their children's free unashamed sexuality and continues right up to the day when they hand you your doctoral diploma with a bleeding shriveled pair of testicles stapled to the parchment.... What's missing, from kindergarten to graduate school is honest recognition of what's actually happening -- turned-on awareness of hairy goodies underneath the pettipants, the chinos and the flannels. It's not that sex needs to be pushed in school; sex is push enough... But we should let it be, where it is and like it is. I don't insist that ladies in junior high school lovingly caress their students' cocks (someday maybe); however, it is reasonable to ask that the ladies don't by example and stricture, teach their students to pretend those cocks aren't there. As things stand now, students are psychically castrated or spayed -- and for the very same reason that black men are castrated in Georgia: because they're a threat."
58. Fischer, John H. "Who Needs Schools?" Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 78-79. Fischer is president of Teachers College, Columbia University. "The issue whether schools should be publicly or privately controlled, competitive or monopolistic, is overshadowed, however, by a prior and more basic question: Are they necessary? While a flat negative answer would be as irresponsible as it would be shocking to most people, the question cannot be dismissed out of hand....The radical question must be raised, for it deserves a well-considered response."
59. Friedrich, Carl J. The New Image of the Common Man. Boston: Beacon Press, 1950. 382 pp. "In the United States the intelligentsia, whether benevolent or malevolent, continue to think of 'the masses' or at any rate of 'the other fellow' when they speak of the common man....Time and again I have had to point out that 'he common man is you and me!' -- that the common man is 'everyman' when not concerned with his specialty....Politics in a democracy is adult education, at least half the time. We may not think of it that way, but the educational value of a free discussion of public affairs is nevertheless one of the most important arguments in favor of democracy. John Stuart Mill put it very well in his Representative Government. Arguing

against the Greek philosophers, especially Plato, he pointed out that the notion of an ideal king is bad, because the more benevolent his rule, the more enervating its effect in the long run. 'Their minds are formed by, and consenting to, this abdication of their own energies.' It is this active participation which makes of democratic politics a school for adults. How can this participation be elicited? How can we rouse ourselves to facing the same issues which the schools are groping toward in their work with children?"

60. Fromm, Erich. The Revolution of Hope: Toward a Humanized Technology. New York: Bantam Books, Inc., 1968. 179 pp. (Available in paperback at 95 cents from Bantam Books, Inc., 666 Fifth Avenue, New York, New York 10019 or in hardback from Harper & Row Publishers, Inc., 49 E. 33rd Street, New York, New York 10016.) "The conclusion seems unavoidable that the ideas of activation, responsibility, participation -- that is of the humanization of technological society -- can find full expression only in a movement which is not bureaucratic, not connected with political machines, and which is the result of active and imaginative efforts by those who share the same aims. Such a movement itself, in its organization and method, would be expressive of the aim to which it is devoted: to educate its members for the new kind of society in the process of striving for it."
61. Fromm, Erich. The Sane Society. New York: Rinehart & Co., Inc., 1955. 370 pp. "Why should society feel responsible only for the education of children, and not for the education of all adults at every age? Actually, as Alvin Johnson has pointed out so convincingly, the age between six and eighteen is not by far as suitable as is generally assumed. It is, of course, the best age to learn the three R's, and languages, but undoubtedly the understanding of history, philosophy, religion, literature, psychology, etcetera, is limited at this early age, and in fact, even around twenty, at which age these subjects are taught in college, it is not ideal. In many instances to really understand the problems in these fields, a person must have had a great deal more experience in living than he has had at college age. For many people the age of thirty or forty is much more appropriate for learning -- in the sense of understanding rather than memorizing -- than school or college age, and in many instances the general interest is also greater at the later age than at the stormy period of youth. It is around this age also at which a person should be free to change his occupation completely, and hence to have a chance to study again, the same chance which today we permit only our youngsters. A sane society must provide possibilities for adult education, much as it provides today for the schooling of children. This principle finds expression today in the increasing number of adult-education courses, but all these private arrangements encompass only a small segment of the population, and the principle needs to be applied to the population as a whole."
62. Goodman, Paul. Compulsory Mis-education and the Community of Scholars. New York: Vintage Books, 1964. 339 pp. (Paperback available at \$1.95 from Vintage Books, a Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York New York 10022.) "The dominance of the present school auspices prevents any new thinking about education, although we face unprecedented conditions.... The immediate future of our country seems to me to have two looming prospects,

both gloomy. If the powers-that-be proceed as stupidly, timidly, and 'politically' as they have been doing, there will be a bad breakdown and the upsurge of a know-nothing fascism of the right. Incidentally, let me say that I am profoundly unimpressed by our so-called educational system when, as has happened, Governor Wallace comes from the South as a candidate in Northern states and receives his highest number of votes (in some places a majority) in suburbs that have had the most years of schooling, more than 16. The other prospect -- which to be frank, seems to me to be the goal of the school-monks themselves -- is a progressive regimentation and brainwashing, on scientific principles, directly toward a fascism-of-the-center, 1984. Certainly this is not anybody's deliberate purpose; but given the maturing of automation, and the present dominance of the automating spirit in schooling, so that all of life becomes geared to the automatic system, that is where we will land."

63. Hutchins, Robert M. The Learning Society. New York: Frederick A. Praeger, Publishers, 1968. 142 pp (Paperback edition available at \$1.25 from Mentor Books % New American Library, 1301 Avenue of the Americas, New York, New York 10019.) "Is it possible to go further and foresee the learning society? This would be one that, in addition to offering part-time adult education to every man and woman at every stage of grown-up life, had succeeded in transforming its values in such a way that learning, fulfillment, becoming human, had become its aims and all its institutions were directed to this end. This is what the Athenians did....They did not have much of an educational system. But they have been educators of the human race. In Athens, education was not a segregated activity, conducted for certain hours, in certain places, at a certain time of life. It was the aim of the society. The city educated the man. The Athenian was educated by the culture, by paideia. This was made possible by slavery. The Athenian citizen had leisure; the Greek word for leisure is the origin of our word for school. The Athenian was expected to turn his free time into leisure, into learning how to govern himself and his community. Slavery gave him the free time....Machines can do for every modern man what slavery did for the fortunate few in Athens. The vision of the learning society, or, as Sir Julian Huxley has put it, the fulfillment society, can be realized. A world community learning to be civilized, learning to be human, is at last a possibility. Education may come into its own."
64. Keller, George C. "The Cost -- and Price -- of Education," Nation, Vol. 210, No. 8, (March 2, 1970), pp. 242-244. "As education has moved to stage center, as it has become instrumental to economic and military supremacy, the cry rises that it is being distorted and shackled. Has education become increasingly an enterprise dedicated to the production of 'useful' knowledge and of specialized 'brainpower'? Is the very nature of 'rationality' being subtly redefined -- from a process of raising disturbing, complicated, interrelated questions about the ingredients of a good life and a just society to one of refining the data and methods of particular fields, whose place and aims are largely unexamined and whose results for society are unmonitored?"

65. Kennedy, Edward M. "Beginning Anew in Latin America," Saturday Review, (Oct. 17, 1970), pp. 18-21. "For a decade, we have emphasized the need for alliance and we have forgotten the need for progress....We are starting a new decade; let us discard cold war concepts and look to the future."
66. Knowles, Malcolm S. "An Experiment with Group Self-Directed Learning: The Learning-Teaching Team." in The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy Versus Pedagogy. By Malcolm Knowles. New York: Association Press, 1970. Also in The Changing College Classroom. Edited by Philip Runkel, Roger Harrison, and Margaret Runkel. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1969. (The Knowles book can be ordered at \$12.95 from Association Press, 291 Broadway, New York, New York 10007.) "(An) observation that is supported by a large volume of evaluative statements obtained from students at the completion of their degree programs (using this approach) is that for most students learning to become self-directed learners is a euphoric, ego-expanding experience. They report, that when they came into the program, they viewed education as a chore, a self-degrading necessity, or, at best, a mostly irrelevant means for gaining a status-conferring degree. But when they really mastered the art of self-directed and collaborative learning, education became a thing of beauty, an aesthetic experience, a life-enhancing activity."
67. Kulich, Jinda. An Historical Overview of the Adult Self-Learner. Vancouver 8, British Columbia, Canada: University Extension, University of British Columbia, 1970. 11 pp. mimeographed. "One can say, generally, that up to the fairly recent wide-spread and readily available schooling for everybody, self-education was the prime way for man to cope with the world around him. With the introduction of free compulsory education for children, following the industrial revolution, many educators have forgotten the need of the adult to continue on learning. Although the working man struggling for his place in the industrial society and the North American self-made man provide us with ample examples of the self-educated adult... If we search for support for the claim of man's ability as a self-learner, we can find it already with the Greek philosophers. Socrates spoke about the wise as those who have mastered self-control, and declared himself as a self-learner who is not ashamed to learn from everyone around him. Plato saw as the ultimate goal of education of young the ability of the adult for self-education....On this continent, Benjamin Franklin can be seen as one of the early leaders in self-education. His Autobiography is not only a gospel of the materially successful self-made man; it also points out the way to self-education through reading and discussion....Life-long integrated learning can succeed only if we mobilize the human ability to learn throughout life in a systematic way. Independent study, and the self-learning adult, will have to form a considerable part of this integrated, life-long system education."
68. Lauter, Paul and Florence Howe. "How the School System is Rigged for Failure," New York Review of Books, Vol. 14, No. 12, (June 18, 1970), pp. 14-21. "Are the schools 'failures'? If they do not accomplish the goals which educators have laid out for them, it may well be that all they need -- as the CED, Congress, and Fantini and Weinstein urge -- is more money, more innovation, more machines, more specialization. It may also be, however, that the stated goals of American education are deceptive

and irrelevant ones, that their grand rhetoric clouds the character and social objectives of the schools...What if the apparent 'failures' of the American educational system have served necessary functions in American society? Perhaps the schools, like almost all other American institutions, have been very indeed horrifyingly, successful....In their conscious attempt to impose personal habits of restraint, self-control, diligence, promptness, and sobriety on their students, particularly those from 'loose,' 'shiftless' (or 'disadvantaged') backgrounds, schoolmen served the desires of business for a disciplined and acquiescent work force."

69. Leggett, Stanton. "Thirteen Imperatives for Boards in the Seventies," American School Board Journal, (October 1970). When Rep. Laurence J. Burton (Utah) inserted this article in the Congressional Record for Oct. 14, 1970 (p. E9429) he stated "Mr. Stanton Leggett, one of America's foremost educational consultants, outlines some of the new thoughts boardmen will have to have, and the new actions they will have to take -- If public education that is really free is to have a chance of survival in the seventies." Leggett: "5. The old must listen to the young. If the language is strident, it is, in part, because the issues are great....7. Watch the nonschool grow and grow and grow....13. The schools had better do more than just survive."
70. Liveright, A.A. Editor. Occasional Paper 11: The Concept of Lifelong Integrated Learning, "Education Permanente, and Some Implications for University Adult Education. 60 pp. Excerpts from working papers, presentations and discussions at a seminar on Education Permanente convened by the International Congress of University Adult Education at the Washington Square Campus of New York University on August 5th to 7th, 1967. (For information on price, availability, and ordering write to International Congress of University Adult Education, Mr. William McCallion, Chairman, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario, Canada.) Contributors include W.J. McCallion, J. Roby Kidd, John Walker Powell, Robert Theobald, Bertrand Schwartz, Peter E. Siegle, T.C. Lai, Ayo Ogunsheye, Sidney Raybould, and Ahmad Abd Al-Halim. J. Roby Kidd: "Am I totally mad to dream about a single organization of teachers, teachers of all ages, of all subjects, full and part-time, united around their common allegiance to learning? Mad or not I am willing to take a small wager that it will come before the end of this century. And when it does, teachers will begin to have and to deserve the strength and power and responsibility that is demanded by their higher calling."
71. Maheu, Rene. "Toward an Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 1 (1968). (Original article in French. An English translation is available without charge by writing to Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.) "Personally, I am convinced that the time has come for a radical re-examination of the contents, the methods, and the apparatus of education....For the first time in history it is now possible to tackle the problem of education and endeavour to find solutions on a world-wide scale. We must not hesitate then, to put forward new and bold theories....The

development of adult education is undoubtedly hampered by the difficulties of life, weariness and attrition, and budgetary restrictions. But the most serious obstacles are of a subjective nature: skepticism and intellectual sloth, supported by the routine of institutions. Finally, it is only when adult education becomes for every man both a right and an urge, a duty and a source of pleasure, that it will at last become firmly rooted in the beliefs of the individual and appear as it really is: the most complete and concrete answer to man's material needs and spiritual aspirations." Maheu is Director General of UNESCO.

72. Marin, Peter. "Children of the Apocalypse," Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 71-73+. "What sense can one make of the public schools? They are stiff, unyielding, microcosmic versions of a world that has already disappeared. They are, after all, the state's schools, they do the state's work, and their purpose is the preservation of things as they were. Their means are the isolation of ego and the deflection of energy. Their main structural function is to produce in the young a self-delusive 'Independence' --- a system of false consciousness and need that actually renders them dependent on institutions and the state. Their corrosive role-playing and demand systems are so extensive, so profound, that nothing really human shows through -- and when it does, it appears only as frustration, exhaustion, and anger. That, of course, is the real outrage of the schools: their systematic corruption of the relations of persons. Where they should be comrades, allies, equals, and even lovers, the public schools make them 'teacher' and 'student' -- replaceable units in a mechanical ritual that passes on, in the name of education, an 'emotional plague'; a kind of ego and personality that has been so weakened, so often denied the experience of community or solitude, that we no longer understand quite what these things are or how to achieve them....The most human acts I have ever found in our colleges and high schools are the ones most discouraged, the surreptitious sexuality between teachers and students. Although they were almost always cramped and totally exploitative, they were at least some kind of private touch."
73. McNee, Paul. The Learning Society. Chicago: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults, 1959, 14 pp. mimeographed. Address by the late Dean of the Division of General Education, New York University at Michigan State University-Oakland on April 18, 1959. "Questions in education now trumpeted through the land as of utmost importance will fade away in a very few years in the face of an inexorable pattern of living which requires an education more embracing than any yet known, for more people than ever before, and from cradle-to-the-grave....Yes, there is some reason to think that we are developing a 'Learning Society.' Less frequently now, does a man of any intelligence speak of education as an experience or discipline he has had. It seems clear, too, that with all the pressures and stresses of our day, more status is being conferred on teachers, and more status on learning, despite temporary setbacks."

4. Mills, C. Wright. "Mass Society and Liberal Education," in *Power, Politics and People: The Collected Essays of C. Wright Mills*. Edited by Irving Louis Horowitz. New York: Ballantine Books, 1963. (Several hardback and paperback editions of the book have been printed. The essay itself is available at \$3.00 as an Out-of-Print CSLEA publication, Notes and Essays # 9, from University Microfilms Library Services, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.) "I doubt that education, for adults or for adolescents, is the strategic factor in the building of a democratic polity. I think it is in the picture and must be, but given its present personnel and administration, and its generally powerless position among other politically relevant organizations, it cannot and will not get the job done. Only if it were to become the framework within which more general movements that were under way -- movements with more direct political relevance -- were going on, only then would it have the chance to take the place in American political life that it ought to....But to do so, they (educators and educational institutions) are going to have to get into trouble. For publics that really want to know the realities of their communities and nation and world are, by that determining fact, politically radical. Politics as we know it today often rests upon myths and lies and crackpot notions; and many policies, debated and undebated, assume inadequate and misleading definitions of reality. When such myth and hokum prevail, those who are out to find the truth are bound to be upsetting. This is the role of mind, of intellect, of reason, of ideas: to define reality adequately and in a publicly relevant way. The role of education, especially of education for adults, is to build and sustain policy that will 'go for,' and develop, and live with, and act upon, adequate definitions of reality."

5. Mills, C. Wright. *The Power Elite*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1956. 423 pp. "When crises are defined as total, and as seemingly permanent, the consequences of decision become total, and the decisions in each major area of life come to be integrated and total. Up to a point, these consequences for other institutional orders can be assessed; beyond such points, chances have to be taken. It is then that the felt scarcity of trained and imaginative judgment leads to plaintive feelings among executives about the shortage of qualified successors in political, military, and economic life. This feeling, in turn, leads to an increasing concern with the training of successors who could take over as older men of power retire. In each area, there slowly arises a new generation which has grown up in an age of co-ordinated decisions....What is lacking is a truly common elite program of recruitment and training; for the prep school, Ivy League College, and law school sequence of the metropolitan 400 is not up to the demands now made upon members of the power elite. Britishers, such as Field Marshall Viscount Montgomery, well aware of this lack, recently urged (in a speech at Columbia University) the adoption of a system 'under which a minority of high-caliber young students could be separated from the mediocre and given the best education possible to supply the country with leadership.' His proposal is echoed, in various forms, by many who accept his criticism of 'the American theory of public education on the ground that it is ill-suited to produce the "elite" group of leaders....this country needs to fulfill its obligations of world leadership.' In part these demands reflect the unstated need to transcend recruitment on the sole basis of economic success, especially since it is suspect as often involving the higher immorality;

in part it reflects the stated need to have men who, as Viscount Montgomery says, know 'the meaning of discipline.' But above all these demands reflect the at least vague consciousness on the part of the power elite themselves that the age of co-ordinated decisions, entailing a newly enormous range of consequences, requires a power elite that is of a new caliber. In so far as the sweep of matters which go into the making of decisions is vast and interrelated, the information needed for judgments complex and requiring particularized knowledge, the men in charge will not only call upon one another; they will try to train their successors for the work at hand. These new men will grow up as men of power within the co-ordination of economic and political and military decision.

76. Ohliger, John. "Lifelong Learning -- Voluntary or Compulsory," Adult Leadership, (Sept., 1968), p. 124. "Are we seeking a society where adult education, for all intents and purposes, would be as compulsory as is elementary and secondary education?...It seems to me that adult educators have taken the belief in 'lifelong learning' and, like the little boy, shot an arrow into the air, knowing not where it would fall. Perhaps it is time to stop and take a look at what we are doing to individuals before shooting off any more arrows." (Reprint available without charge by writing to author at address on the first page of this bibliography.)
77. Ohliger, John. "Dialogue with Myself," Adult Leadership, (Feb., 1970), p. 250+. (Reprint available without charge by writing to author at address on first page of this bibliography.) "If adult education becomes compulsory it will negate all the principles of learning established in the field so far. Such principles are based on the idea that learning is a voluntary act."
78. Ohliger, John. "Adult Education: 1984: "December 1970, 6 pp dittoed (for information on the availability of this internal discussion draft write to the author at the address on the first page of this bibliography.) "A child is born in the United States in the year 1984. He can never look forward to getting out of school. From the 'infant school' he starts attending at the age of six months to the 'geriatric learning center' he dies in, he finds himself going to school all his life 'for the good of society.'...When he does die, a minister eulogizes him over his grave...He points out that this man was very lucky, for he was born in 1984, the first year that the national 'Permanent School Law' was in effect. The minister extols the wisdom of the late President Spiro Agnew, who in the last year of his second term of office was able to get such a great law passed. 'And so we bid goodbye to this lucky man.' the minister chants, 'firm in the conviction that he will go to heaven where he will attend a "school for angels" into infinity.'"

79. Reich, Charles A. The Greening of America. 201 E. 50th St., New York, New York 10022: Random House, Inc., 1970. 399 pp. \$7.95. (A long portion of this book was originally published in The New Yorker, Vol. XLVI, No. 32, (Sept. 26, 1970), pp. 42-111.) "Beginning with school, if not before, an individual is systematically stripped of his imagination, his creativity, his heritage, his dreams, and his personal uniqueness, in order to fit him to be a productive unit in a mass technological society.... Our present system has gone beyond anything that could properly be called the creation of capitalism or imperialism or a power elite. That would at least be a human shape. Of course, a power elite does exist, and is made rich by the system, but the members of the elite are no longer in control; they are now merely taking advantage of forces that have a life of their own.... Editorials denouncing students, often say that a student who does not like the way a university is run should leave. But society makes it all but mandatory for a young person to complete his education, and in their rules and practices most universities are extraordinarily alike. Moreover, the penalty for many young men who leave is to be drafted. Under these circumstances, it is hardly accurate to say that a student has submitted 'voluntarily' to a university's rules.... The integration of the corporate state makes inescapable what was formerly voluntary, and powers that once were small and gentle become monstrous and terrifying.... The only people who can successfully change an organization or institution are those who already possess power within it -- people who are acting in their capacities as workers or consumers. A school teacher, no matter what he thinks or says, cannot change the public-school system while conforming to it by accepting its regulations. But if the teacher changes his behavior as a teacher, ignoring the threat to his personal ambitions that may be a consequence, then change must and will take place. A steadily increasing number of the nation's most idealistic and intelligent young college graduates are going into public-school teaching, and these young people will profoundly change the public-school system despite every effort of the established school bureaucracy to prevent change. They will overpower the school authorities from within, because, being a necessary part of the system, they cannot be prevented from doing so. If the young teachers are willing to accept the consequences of their resistance, they will not be merely voicing opinions -- they will have put their opinions into their working lives.... Every evidence suggests that boys and girls in high school, in junior high, and even in grade school are potentially more radical, more deeply committed to a new way of life, than their elders in college."

80. Robinson, Sunny. Formation of the Learning Community. 122 pp. 1970. memo. (For information on obtaining this document: write to Professor Malcolm Knowles, Department of Administration and Supervision, School of Education, Boston University, Boston, Mass.) "What is a Learning Community? To the author, a Learning Community is a collection of people with diverse learning needs who have come together in a less structured, more self-directed way to try out new styles of learning within the context of temporary systems. It is a place and way of working together to serve one's own learning needs as well as those of others around and with you. Thus, activity in such a setting gives also a sense of community (belonging, needing, sharing and

being responsible) and not just learning (acquisition of new knowledge and/or behavior)."

81. Rogers, Carl R. Freedom to Learn. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Publishing Co., 1969. 358 pp. (Paperback edition available at \$3.95 from Charles E. Merrill Publishing Co., 1300 Alum Creek Dr., Columbus, Ohio 43216.) "It does not seem reasonable to impose freedom on anyone who does not desire it. Consequently it seems wise, if it is at all possible, that when a group is offered the freedom to learn on their own responsibility, there should also be provision for those who do not wish or desire this freedom and prefer to be instructed and guided.... Education -- our most conservative institution."
82. Roszak, Theodore. The Making of a Counter Culture: Reflections on the Technocratic Society and Its Youthful Opposition. New York: Anchor Books, 1968. 303 pp. (Available in paperback at \$1.95 from Anchor Books % Doubleday & Co., Inc., 501 Franklin Ave., Garden City, New York 11531.) "We call it 'education,' the 'life of the mind,' the 'pursuit of the truth.' But it is a matter of machine-tooling the young to the needs of our various baroque bureaucracies: corporate, governmental, military, trade union, educational... The universities produce the brains the technocracy needs; therefore, making trouble on the campus is making trouble in one of the economy's vital sectors. And once the graduate students -- many of whom may be serving as low-level teaching assistants -- have been infected with qualms and aggressive discontents, the junior faculty, with whom they overlap, may soon catch the fevers of dissent and find themselves drawn into the orbit of 'youth.'...The young, miserably educated as they are, bring with them almost nothing but healthy instincts. The project of building a sophisticated framework of thought atop those instincts is rather like trying to graft an oak tree upon a wild flower. How to sustain the oak tree? More important, how to avoid crushing the wildflower? And yet such is the project that confronts those of us who are concerned with radical social change. For the young have become one of the very few social levers dissent has to work with. This is that 'significant soil' in which the Great Refusal has begun to take root. If we reject it in frustration for the youthful follies that also sprout there, where do we turn?"
83. Schrag, Peter. "End of the Impossible Dream," Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 68-70+. "The Declining faith in educational institutions is threatening the idea of education itself....If the school system is the only mode of access to social and economic salvation, and if there is only one officially honored definition of such salvation (house in the suburbs, job at IBM, life insurance, and a certain set of manners), and if the school excludes any sizable minority from such salvation, then we have obviously defined ourselves into a choice such revolution and repression."

84. Sheats, Paul H. "New Knowledge for What? " Adult Leadership, Vol. 11 (Jan., 1963). Sheats, former Dean of University of California Extension and now Professor of Adult Education at UCLA, writes here of his "personal concern with what is happening to the processes of free discussion and debate under the impact of the cold war and accelerated change....This problem of increasing citizen competence and of improving the quality of decision making must, it seems to me, be of central concern to (adult educators)...I believe that we have the inventive genius and the capabilities to mount a program which will provide needed information on policy issues before the people and create the kind of communication network through which these informed opinions may influence policy making....The success of efforts in the past and the demonstrated need for improved citizen competence today makes one wonder why the leadership and funds required to mount such a national effort are not now forthcoming. The cost of such a program would be infinitesimal when compared with expenditures either in defense or on the space race. It is difficult to see how an open society can preserve its strength without nurturing and facilitating the free play of ideas in the marketplace. Deeply imbedded in the American creed is the concept of education as the development of the capacity for growth of the individual to the full realization of his potentiality. This creed, expressing as it does, faith in the perfectibility of man and in the possibility that his destiny is still subject to rational control, can be given new vitality by a national program to generate civic competence and public responsibility. Conceivably, we have now within our grasp a new kind of society -- 'a learning society' made up of educative communities in which we can accelerate not only the discovery of the new knowledge but its application to the betterment of the human condition. In this view, life is learning, the national dialogue will continue, and the search for truth, hammered out in the crossfire of free discussion and debate, will go forward. To these ends, our joint efforts must be dedicated."
85. Silberman, Charles. Crisis in the Classroom: The Remaking of American Education. New York: Random House, 1970. 553 pages. (Order at \$10.00 from Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022) This is the result of the three-and-a-half year, \$300,000 study commissioned by the Carnegie Corporation. Lawrence A. Cremin, Professor of Education at Columbia's Teachers College, chaired the Advisory Commission. "The dean of a liberal arts college in a large Eastern university arranges a short course in teaching methods for his faculty, to be given by senior members of the faculty of the university's graduate school of education. The course confirms all the prejudices the liberal arts professors had about educationists and adds a few more. At the first session, for example, the educationist -- the ed. school's most distinguished authority on adult education -- tells the assembled faculty that it is important for a teacher to see things from the learner's perspective as well as his own. While he realizes that it may not always be possible for them to do so, he goes on to say, it is nonetheless essential that they try their very best to learn at least one new thing about their subject each year, so that they can recapture, however fleetingly, the learner's perspective. (The second session is devoted in large measure to an exposition of the superiority of yellow chalk vi.-a-vis white chalk.)"

86. Southern, Albert M. "Dissertation Proposal: Attitude Generalization Among Students in University Courses on Adult Education When Given Increased Opportunities for Self-Direction." Dec. 1970. 16 pp. Xeroxed. (For information on availability write to Albert Southern % John Ohliger at the address on the first page of the bibliography.) "The investigation herein seeks to explore feedback from a group of learners when they are given an opportunity to experience an innovative approach in learning; a learner-helper approach giving more responsibility to the students....The goal of this investigation is to explore the differences in attitudes that are measurable in the learners in a course in which additional self-responsibility was given to the students...One group (Experimental Group) will, at the beginning of the course, be told that they will be permitted and expected to actively participate in planning class activities and to responsibly implement the plans that are made. The other group (Control Group) will use, without option, the same text, reading assignment, and final examination that had been selected and used in the course for several years previously. The same professor will teach both sections."
87. Stillman, Colleen McCarthy. "Dissertation Proposal." December, 1970. 12 pp mimeographed. (For availability of this document write to Mrs. Stillman at the address on the first page of this bibliography.) "Amidst current discussions on educational forecasting, concepts of process and integrated life-long learning, there is a noteworthy absence of dialogue on the emergence of compulsory adult education. From a hasty glance at activities on the national scene, it is apparent that diverse 'compulsory' programs are in full-scale operation and a cursory examination of statements made by leading adult educators suggests that more will be on their way....The jejune usage of the word 'voluntary' calls for re-evaluation in light of the evolutionary phenomenon of adult education. One objective of this dissertation then is to look at the field of adult education through the prism of the voluntary-compulsory dynamic, in an attempt to provide new meaning, new connectives to the field. By constructing a typology of educational imperatives which will provide the integrative force to the examination, I endeavor to establish a multi-dimensional theoretical base for the study of adult education, which will thrust new shafts into the fabric of program planning, methodology, curriculum development, administration and research design."
88. Theobald, Robert. "Accent on Social Philosophy: Education For A New Era or How To Understand The Need For A Compassionate Revolution," Adult Leadership, Vol. 18, No. 5, (Nov. 1969), p. 148. "It is only the process of discovering whether the assumptions by which we live are truly valid which constitutes education. This process is inductive. It can never be taken over by computers. Rather it requires the imaginative cooperation of all those who are interested. Adult education should be pioneering in the development of this real form of education, the dialogic form of education pioneered by Socrates and periodically rediscovered since. It forms our only hope for the future....But while adult educators should be particularly involved in this form of education, there are many questions as to whether they will be. Adult educators are, in general, liberals and we are just coming to perceive that liberals possess a deeply manipulative philosophy. This new form of education requires a profound respect for the individual's capacity to determine what he needs to know and to create his own direction. The industrial age has

led us to treat people as cogs in a machine -- this point is now no longer really controversial. It is now also clear, however, that the continuation of the dehumanization of man will destroy life on earth. The question today is whether adult educators will take part in the required compassionate revolution."

89. Theobald, Robert. An Alternative Future for America II: Essays and Speeches. Chicago: The Swallow Press, Inc., 1968. 199 pp. (paperback edition available at \$2.00 from The Swallow Press, Inc., 1139 South Wabash Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60605.) "If we are to be able to create an educational system valid for the future, we must accept that the area seen as education by the individual will depend on his own purposes. This implies, in turn, that there must be many styles of educational institutes for the many educational purposes which exist now and for the even wider range which will come into existence as we encourage the diversity made possible by the new technologies." The book ends with a "Working Appendix" listing "some emerging initiatives relevant to the alternative future envisioned in this book." Among them are the Educational Policy Research Center, the Aspen Seminar for Environmental Arts and Sciences, Human Potential Seminars, the Spaceship Earth Curriculum Project, Vocations for Social Change, St. Mary Center for Learning, The Living-Learning Center at the University of Minnesota, Student Campus Improvement System, Office of Academic Innovation at the University of California, the Radical Research Center at Carleton College, The Whole Earth Catalog, the Dialogue Series of Bobbs-Merrill Co., Inc., audio visual materials on implications of the new technologies of the National Council of Churches, Teg's 1994 (see below), the New Schools Exchange, the Teacher Drop-out Center of the University of Massachusetts, the World Future Society, the Ecology Action Educational Institute, the World Game of Buckminster Fuller, "World Ecology Year 1972" of the Growth Centers of North America, the newsservice/ newsletter Earth Read-out, the magazine The Teacher Paper, and The Environmental Handbook. Information on these and on additional programs and materials is available in a packet from the Center for Curriculum Design, Box AF, Kendall College, Evanston, Illinois 60204. The cost of this packet including Dialogue on Education (one of the paperbacks edited by Theobald in the Bobbs-Merrill series) plus placement on the Center's mailing list, is \$5.00 .
90. Theobald, Robert and J.M. Scott. Teg's 1994: An Anticipation of the Near Future. 114 pages, mimeographed and published in the Fall of 1969. (Available at \$5.00 from Personalized Secretarial Service, 5045 North 12th Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85012). "Teg's 1994 sketches a possible future world where the techno-system acts merely as infra-structure, expansion and growth are no longer goals and human society has reemphasized social interaction through worldwide decentralization into small, sub-cultural communities." The authors seek to engage the reader in a dialogue about this "participation book."

91. Toffler, Alvin. Future Shock. 201 E. 50th St., New York, New York 10022: Random House, Inc., 1970. 505 pp. \$8.95. "Earnest intellectuals talk bravely about 'educating for change' or 'preparing people for the future.' But we know virtually nothing about how to do it....In all the talk about the need for continuing education, in all the popular discussions of retraining, there is an assumption that man's potentials for re-education are unlimited. This is, at best, an assumption, not a fact, and it is an assumption that needs close and scientific scrutiny....We shall watch the irresistible growth of companies already in the experiential field, and the formation of entirely new enterprises, both profit and non-profit, to design, package and distribute planned or programmed experiences....Education, already exploding in size, will become one of the key experience industries as it begins to employ experiential techniques to convey both knowledge and values to students....Long before the year 2000, the entire antiquated structure of degrees, majors, and credits will be a shambles. No two students will move along exactly the same educational track. For the students now pressuring higher education to destandardize, to move toward super-industrial diversity, will win the battle....Failure to diversify education within the system will simply lead to the growth of alternative opportunities outside the system."
92. Tollett, Kenneth and William Ewald, Rexford Tugwell, Robert M. Hutchins, John Wilkinson, Mark Triebwasser, Harry S. Ashmore, Piers von Simson, and James Wood. Adolescence Is No Time for School. Audio-tape. 28 minutes, 58 seconds. (Order as Tape #510 for \$7.50 from The Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, P. O. Box 4446, Santa Barbara, California 93103. Available either on five-inch 3 3/4 i.p.s. half track tapes or on cassettes. Free study guide available with tape on request). Kenneth Tollett, Dean of the Law School of Texas Southern University: "The university must make greater allowances for integrating the emotions and the intellect." Robert M. Hutchins, Chairman, Fund for the Republic: "Nicholas Murray Butler (late president, Columbia University) and Will Ogburn (late sociologist) both said almost simultaneously fifty years ago that the explosion of information was such that we were going to have to prolong adolescence at least until age forty-five in order to get it all into our students." John Wilkinson, philosopher and physicist: "One could contest this idea that there has been this explosion of information. In fact, most of the scientists who were here at the Center (for the Study of Democratic Institutions) for the ecology conferences were of the impression that there hadn't been an explosion of information, there had been an explosion of data....There has been a great deal of simplification. Astronomers can now operate with a few equations....We can learn a hell of a lot more than anybody in the past with very little effort if we have got the right kind of preparation." Hutchins: "The whole point of the Danish Folk High School is the idea that you get enough education so that you're not a danger to yourself and society and then you have some time to mature before you come back and go at it again. The Danish Folk High School, which has spread all over Scandinavia, is an adult educational institution. It is entirely devoted to non-vocational subjects....Maybe, as part of the general move toward de-institutionalization, that I think we're in for in education, we ought to think about the university in a different way."

93. Tough, Allen M. Learning Without a Teacher: A Study of Tasks and Assistance During Adult Self-teaching Projects. Educational Research Series No. 3. Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada: PUBLICATIONS, The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, 252 Bloor Street West, 1967, 92 pp. \$1.75 . (Also a brief outline of research in progress in this area is available by writing to Allen Tough, Department of Adult Education, OISE). "The data clearly support a major hypothesis in the study; namely, that self-teachers can and do perform several of the tasks of a professional teacher....The amount of assistance received by the self-teachers was very great....Although the effectiveness of self-teaching was not studied, it became evident during the interviews that many adults who decide to teach themselves some large and difficult body of knowledge and skills do so quite successfully....Perhaps the ultimate question to be tackled by future research into self-teaching is this: how can professional educators improve the quality and scope of the subject matter and the effectiveness of the methodology in self-teaching?"
94. Wills, Garry. Nixon Agonistes: The Crisis of the Self-Made Man. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 2 Park Street, Boston, Massachusetts 02107, 617 pp. \$10.00 . "The academic market is based on the pretense that real intellectual neutrality toward ideas can be maintained; that ideas will, of themselves, join, struggle, clash in the blank arena of the mind. The liberal intellect should first be a mere observer, detached and impartial ('may the best idea win'), so that it may finally be the arbiter, raising the glove of the victorious idea. Yet it is only the mind that can conceive ideas, be their vehicle, urge them, reject them. Ideas will not carry themselves into battle, act by some inner energy upon the passive observing mind. The picture of the mind as somehow above ideas, arbitrating over them, is one of the attempts to find a mechanism in nature that will yet be above it, an invisible hand 'self-regulating.' Thus truth is said to reside in the mind's openness toward ideas, yet also in the ideas that prevail; and the mind gets from its first impartial stance to its later acceptance without ever being quite responsible for the outcome. It was not an advocate of the winning idea at the outset, but a judge, finally, of the outcome--which leaves the ideas without any original advocates....Under challenge, academicians retreat to their basic doctrine -- still unaware that this intellectual 'market' is as rickety with pretense as the economic one. Yet students, tortured by the contradictions involved in campus war work, are probing to more basic inconsistencies. For instance: (1) A truly value-free openness toward ideas does not, and cannot, exist in the academy, for several reasons. One of them is theoretical: certain ideas cannot be entertained, at least not seriously, because they would of their nature 'close the market.' Totalist systems, therefore -- revealed religions, philosophies that proclaim an absolute truth, political systems (whether fascist or communist) that proscribe certain kinds of opinion -- cannot in theory be advocated at public schools....(2) Aside from this theoretical limit to openness, there is a practical limit. It is impossible to get up every morning and rebuild one's conceptual world ex nihilo, to achieve an Emersonian mental rebirth every day. One necessarily assumes a great deal, working with what one believes to be the best assumptions which are the actual framework of one's thinking. Beyond this personal set of ruling assumptions, there is the need to talk with others, to focus research, to finish an eight-

week project with one's colleague....All this is normal enough; indeed, it would be impossible to get any work done if such practical exclusions did not take place. What is unsettling to intellectual honesty is the pretense (e.g. in the University of California Handbook), that such inhibition, such fostering of orthodoxies, does not take place, that the play of ideas is entirely free....(8) Although the system claims to be value-free, a loose orthodoxy exists in each area of modern study, an orthodoxy made up of the Propositions X that are favored by leaders of the profession. And it is precisely the claim of objectivity and openness that narrows the range of questions that can be asked about Proposition X -- e.g., it cannot be challenged from 'absolutist' directions. In fact, the more technical, minute, and 'objective' study becomes, the more does it stand in need of an embracing, unquestioned Proposition X: to study in detail the minnow, and be rated on one's results, one needs a firm aquatic category within which, vicariously, to swim with one's subject, and send melodious, measurable bubbles up the exposed aquarium side. One not only narrows one's assumptions, structures one's professional world of exploration, but does this in order to make the assumptions procedurally unquestionable. (9) Measuring the bubbles becomes all-important to the academician's career. The pretense that there is no orthodoxy means that a teacher is supposedly judged only by his competence in his field. Thus 'absolutists' or holders of Non-X, must be found to be, not wrong, but 'incompetent.' And teachers who are socially or politically unacceptable to their fellows cannot be dismissed on such grounds (often reasonable), but must also be declared incompetent...(10) The result is that few, if any, men in America live so entirely on their professional reputations as do academicians, guard that reputation jealously, rate it against others' with such regularity....Thus, in a world consecrated to the disinterested search for truth, envy and petty competitiveness thrive.... (12) The egalitarian side of the academy was, in principle, intellectual rather than social -- openness gave each idea an equal chance, academic freedom gave each teacher the right to follow his research to any conclusion, and purity of research was guaranteed by the determination to impose no orthodoxy....Thus there was equality in the sphere of ideas, and (by extension) among those 'dissecting' the ideas; but this equality did not extend to students. The relation of teacher to student was semiparental and authoritarian. The student, who comes to an institute to learn, proclaims by that very act that he does not know; the teacher is accredited as one who does know; and the process of teaching was to be one of transferring measurable amounts of knowledge from the clearly labeled possessor of that knowledge to one just as clearly labeled as deficient in it....Yet the real solvent of the teacher-student relationship is the fundamental doctrine of the academy, the free play of ideas. For if any idea is to be given equal hearing, then any idea's advocate must be given equal hearing. After all, how do we know, the professor knows more than the student, once the student 'dissents' -- i.e. expresses a different idea? That question, too, must be kept 'open,' not solved a priori; solved only by dialogue -- and dialogue is conducted by equals. Thus the parent-child, or patron-client relationship was always at war with an equal-to-equal relationship forced on the unwilling faculty by that faculty's own first principles. (13) The faculty's means of reasserting authority in this situation is to declare the student's opinion, not false, but incompetent. (14) The result of all this is what Marcuse identified (but clumsily analyzed) as 'repressive tolerance.' That is, a situation exists wherein a covert set of values (whether true or not, good or not, is beside the point) is defended

while official pretense is made of being 'neutral' toward the masked values. And since there is (by the official myth) no orthodoxy, no specific provision has to be made for dissent from the orthodoxy. Dissent is supposed to be the orthodoxy -- though that is far from true. What is left, then, of Schlesinger's claim that students are in rebellion against society, not against the university? The university has been intertwined with our society from the outset, a servant to its political ideals, a partner in its procedures. In fact, the university concentrates and throws into relief the inconsistencies of society, makes them particularly striking because of the academy's claim to a superior standard of intellectual purity and consistency of behavior. Thus Paul Jacobs and Saul Landau concluded, in The New Radicals, that student rebellion began at Berkeley because of that school's liberalism, not despite it."

95. Wofford, Harris, Jr., editor. Embers of the World: Conversations with Scott Buchanan. P.O. Box 4068, Santa Barbara, California 93103: The Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, 1970. 259 pp. \$2.25 . Paperback. Buchanan: "I think teaching is primarily the business of listening to the pupil and responding to whatever happens in the pupil with further questions, and it could be the questions are statements. I mean statements are questions if you understand them properly -- they're proposals to entertain something. A statement is saying, 'Well, what do you think of this?' Then when you hear what they think of this, you try some more. Jacques Maritain's book on education is one of the best statements I've heard about what a teacher does in this respect. He thinks of a teacher as knowing more than the pupil does, yet in some sense not conveying it but seeing that it is made available to the pupil. The great use of superior knowledge is to understand what the pupil is learning as it is learned. It takes great wisdom to be able to follow a learning pupil sensitively enough to know what the next step is for him, and you don't press the next step. You watch it happen. If it sticks, you help it a bit, but it's not a transmission or an imposition or a filling of a vessel or any of those things. Those are all bad images of the real teaching function: the real one is this penetration of the intelligence, of one intelligence into another." Wofford: "Do you put the Socratic seminar at the center of your vision of an educating community?...Can a republic ever really be a learning community in that sense? Can a community of learning be republican?"...Buchanan: "The American republic was a real republic until the Civil War when it contradicted itself and fell to pieces for the time being, and it hasn't really recovered since in the political sense." Wofford: "You can see Lincoln as the most Socratic person in American history?" Buchanan: "I think that's true. He had a lot of traits that are not Socratic in the obvious sense, but there is this: he was a brooder. This is the word used about him so much. He was listening in a curious way to what was going on throughout the community -- kind of a brooding presence over the whole thing. People forget this side of Socrates. They think of him as a noisy questioner, but if the Platonic picture is at all correct, Socrates was a great listener, a better listener than a talker. His responses to what his opponents said show this. He was brooding over things. This is a good description of good teaching: brooding, almost in the literal sense, the way a hen broods over her chickens."

Grateful acknowledgment is extended to Braxton Tewart, Charles Brown, Colleen McCarthy Stillman, Mary Vogel, and David Williams for their help and suggestions in preparing this bibliography. Additional copies are available, and help in locating items may be obtained, by writing to John Ohliger at the address on the heading of the first page. Suggestions for additions to this bibliography are solicited.

ERIC Clearinghouse

MAR 1 0 1971

on Adult Education